

## Research Article

# The Overstated Challenge: Analysing the Challenge of Southern Criminology to the Hegemony of Northern Criminology and its Implications for Criminological Theory in the 21st Century

Shilun Zhou\*<sup>1</sup>

Received: 31 January 2024 / Accepted: 2 August 2024  
© The Author(s), 2024

## Abstract

As crime globalises, Southern criminology has moved from a marginalised field to a significant area of study, challenging the dominance of Northern criminology. This paper argues that while these challenges are noteworthy, they are often overstated. Addressing them is crucial for improving criminology's epistemological and theoretical foundations and enabling the discipline to better respond to the criminal phenomena of the 21st century. The first part of the paper explains how Southern criminology challenges the production of traditional criminological knowledge. Following this, the paper refutes the claim that Southern criminology fundamentally threatens Northern approaches, arguing that the extent of the challenge is overstated. It critiques the binary division between the global North and South, highlighting similarities in criminal phenomena. The final section proposes collaborative strategies between Northern and Southern criminology to advance the construction of modern criminological knowledge.

**Keywords** Northern criminology • Southern criminology • decolonisation • hegemony • theoretical criminology

---

<sup>1</sup>Shilun Zhou graduated from Sun Yat-sen University Law School and is currently studying for an LLM in Criminal Law and Criminal Justice at the University of Edinburgh. In the third year of undergraduate studies, Zhou published a paper as the sole author in *Collected Journal of Shanghai Legal Studies* (CSSCI)

## 1. Introduction

In an era marked by the escalating globalisation of crime, the influence of Southern criminology has progressively transitioned from a marginalised field to a central focus in research.<sup>2</sup> This transition presents theoretical challenges to criminology in the Northern Hemisphere.<sup>3</sup> This paper posits that while Southern criminology challenges Northern criminology's hegemony, these challenges are ultimately overstated. Recognising and addressing these challenges is imperative for improving the epistemological framework and theoretical contributions of criminology, thereby equipping it to confront 21st-century criminal phenomena more effectively. This paper provides evidence and examples from different states and indigenous groups.

This paper is structured into four distinct sections. The first section highlights that the challenges posed by Southern criminology significantly impact the conventional model of knowledge construction in the field. Under the requirement for balancing knowledge production and distribution, these challenges should be taken seriously. Following this, the paper refutes the notion that Southern criminology fundamentally challenges prevailing traditional Northern criminology approaches. It demonstrates that these views overstate the challenge Southern criminology posed to traditional Northern criminology. The paper analyses the breaking away from common dualistic thinking, which suggests a fundamental dichotomy between the global North and South, and acknowledges the similarities in critical phenomena between the two regions. The third and final sections explore strategies for Northern and Southern criminology to address these challenges collaboratively. This approach is explored through the lens of criminological research thinking, methodologies, and theoretical content, aiming to refine and improve the pattern of knowledge construction in criminology for the 21st century.

---

<sup>2</sup> Matthews, Roger. "False Starts, Wrong Turns and Dead Ends: Reflections on Recent Developments in Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 25, no. 4 (2017): 577-591.

<sup>3</sup> Greenberg, David F. "The Weak Strength of Social Control Theory." *Crime & Delinquency* 45, no.1 (1999): 66-81.

## **2. The significance of the challenges posed by Southern criminology to Northern criminology's hegemony**

It is suggested that the challenges posed by Southern criminology significantly undermine the universality of Northern criminological theories.<sup>4</sup> Criminological knowledge refers to the understanding of crime, criminal offenders, delinquency, and the treatment of these aspects within the legal system.<sup>5</sup> The importance of this challenge becomes apparent when contextualising these challenges within the broader framework of constructing criminological knowledge, which cannot be overlooked by traditional Northern criminology.

### **2.1 The significance of the challenges to the construction of criminological knowledge**

The influence of Southern criminology challenges traditional Northern criminology, and this is evident in its questioning of the Northern criminological knowledge framework.<sup>6</sup> This challenge takes two primary forms: contesting the asymmetry in understanding the substance of criminological knowledge and addressing the disparity in the control over the influence of said knowledge. First, as with other social sciences, criminology's knowledge base is largely dominated by Western academics, literature, and perspectives, leading to the marginalisation or overlooking of non-Western criminological scholarship.<sup>7</sup> This phenomenon results in a knowledge disparity between Northern and Southern criminology. The landscape of criminological knowledge, predominantly shaped by white male scholars from the US and UK, manifests the asymmetry in criminological knowledge construction through disparities in funding opportunities, access to academic journals, brain drain, and language barriers.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> Matthews, Roger. "False Starts, Wrong Turns and Dead Ends: Reflections on Recent Developments in Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 25, no. 4 (2017): 577-591.

<sup>5</sup> Laub, John H., and Robert J. Sampson. "The Sutherland-Glueck debate: On the sociology of criminological knowledge." *American Journal of Sociology* 96, no.6 (1991): 1402-1440.

<sup>6</sup> Matthews, Roger. "False Starts, Wrong Turns and Dead Ends: Reflections on Recent Developments in Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 25, no. 4 (2017): 577-591.

<sup>7</sup> Moosavi, Leon. "Decolonising Criminology: Syed Hussein Alatas on Crimes of the Powerful." *Critical Criminology* 27, no. 2 (2018): 229-242.

<sup>8</sup> Aas, Katja F. "The Earth is one but the world is not." *Theoretical Criminology* 16, no.1 (2012): 5-20.

Second, this asymmetry mirrors a broader power imbalance in the mastery of knowledge, and the influence of Southern criminology challenges the prevailing dominance of Northern knowledge power and its internal power dynamics.<sup>9</sup> Southern criminology represents a democratised epistemology, focused on combating racism, colonialism, and imperialism, and so it poses a challenge to the dominant intellectual frameworks of colonialism established by Northern criminology.<sup>10</sup> Therefore, Southern criminology contests the power imbalance and the privileged status of global Northern epistemology.<sup>11</sup> As Southern criminology seeks to integrate truth production into a reciprocal discourse with traditional Northern criminology, its impact on knowledge construction methodologies is profound, challenging the notion that truth is exclusively the purview of Northern criminology.<sup>12</sup> In addressing this challenge, Southern criminology aims to recalibrate the balance in the construction of criminological knowledge.

## **2.2 The challenge of the imbalanced criminological knowledge production posed by Southern criminology**

The challenge posed by Southern criminology is evident in the pattern of knowledge production and distribution.<sup>13</sup> The influence of Southern criminology on the unbalanced dynamics of criminological knowledge production is significant. Knowledge production is biased in favour of the Global North, specifically, the production of global social science knowledge, much like the distribution of wealth, income, and power.<sup>14</sup> There is a difference between the knowledge produced by Southern criminology and that produced by Northern criminology. Southern criminological knowledge arises from localised issues, not just Northern knowledge production.

---

<sup>9</sup> Messner, Steven F. "When west meets east: Generalising theory and expanding the conceptual toolkit of criminology." *Asian Journal of Criminology* 10, no.2 (2015): 117-129.

<sup>10</sup> Dimou, Eleni. "Decolonizing Southern Criminology: What Can the "Decolonial Option" Tell Us About Challenging the Modern/Colonial Foundations of Criminology?" *Critical Criminology* 29, (2021): 431-450.

<sup>11</sup> Scott, John G, et al. "What can Southern Criminology Contribute to a Post-Race Agenda?" *Asian Journal of Criminology* 13, no. 2 (2018): 155–173.

<sup>12</sup> Brown, Mark. "Truth and Method in Southern Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 29, no.3 (2021): 451-467.

<sup>13</sup> Carrington, Kerry, et al. *Southern Criminology* (London and New York: Routledge 2018), Ch6.

<sup>14</sup> *ibid.*

This difference is reflected in the fact that Southern criminological knowledge does not arise exclusively from Northern criminological knowledge production, but rather from localised issues.<sup>15</sup> There are differences between Southern criminology and Northern criminology in the production of knowledge on prison topics. For instance, currently, the crime control culture of the North favours individualism and liberalism, on the basis that a large number of prison topics exist in Northern criminology, such as a focus on overcrowding in prisons and on crime in prisons.<sup>16</sup> In contrast, the culture of control in the South favours collectivism, uses incarceration as the main form of punishment, and treats criminals as enemies rejected by society, adopting strict custodial measures, and the topics on prisons in Northern criminology have long been absent from the criminology of the South.<sup>17</sup> In addition, theoretical research in the South often brings unique perspectives, challenging the universality of conventional Northern criminological knowledge. Southern criminology focuses not only on globalisation-related criminal phenomena, such as global cybercrime, but also on issues localised in a particular region,<sup>18</sup> such as the criminology of mining development in Australia. Australia is endowed with a wealth of mineral resources, which has led to the emergence of a distinct field of study within Australian indigenous criminology. This field of study is concerned with the unique issues of environmental degradation, social disorder, and conflict caused by the exploitation of natural mineral resources in Aboriginal territories,<sup>19</sup> resulting in unique criminological knowledge that is distinct from that produced by Northern criminology.

### **2.3 The challenge of the imbalanced criminological knowledge distribution posed by Southern criminology**

Southern criminology challenges the North's position as the centre of knowledge distribution, affecting both subject matter and distributional structure. The advent of

---

<sup>15</sup> Liu, Jianhong. "Asian Criminology and Non-Western Criminology: Challenges, Strategies, and Directions." *International Annals of Criminology* 59, no. 2 (2021):103-118.

<sup>16</sup> Nelken, David. "Comparative Criminal Justice: Beyond Ethnocentrism and Relativism." *European Journal of Criminology* 6, no.4 (2009): 291-311.

<sup>17</sup> Carrington, Kerry, et al. *Southern Criminology* (London and New York: Routledge 2018), Ch6.

<sup>18</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>19</sup> Carrington, Kerry, et al. "The resource boom's underbelly: Criminological impacts of mining development." *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Criminology* 44, no. 3 (2011): 335-354.

globalisation and the associated economic and cultural interdependencies and shared risks across various regions and countries have extended the capacity for knowledge distribution beyond developed nations, thus rendering it more equitable.<sup>20</sup> For example, the rise of transnational policing and crime has catalysed the exchange of criminological knowledge between the North and the South, promoting supranational governance and steps toward addressing the power imbalance in knowledge distribution. For instance, transnational policing has promoted the exchange of criminological knowledge between the North and South.<sup>21</sup>

Historically, the norm has been to disseminate theories from the Global North to other regions.<sup>22</sup> Southern criminology fosters theoretical innovation grounded in local experiences, disrupting the traditional top-down approach and promoting a bottom-up model.<sup>23</sup> The top-down theoretical approach represents a methodology for introducing novel and pioneering theories when prevailing established theory falls short in elucidating extant criminal phenomena.<sup>24</sup> Conversely, the bottom-up theoretical approach implies a method of applying theories from the criminological body of knowledge to explain the phenomenon of crime. For instance, the occurrence of stabbings in certain Aboriginal communities in Australia cannot be adequately explained by conventional crime control theories alone. This is because stabbing, as an act, is entwined with traditional indigenous practices and is underpinned by complex historical factors that are challenging to eliminate.<sup>25</sup> Consequently, there has been a proposition for an innovative criminological theory based on this crime phenomenon by using the

---

<sup>20</sup> Chan, Janet. "Globalisation, Reflexivity and the Practice of Criminology." *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Criminology* 33, no. 2 (2000): 118-135.

<sup>21</sup> Bowling, B. "Transnational Policing: The Globalisation Thesis, a Typology and a Research Agenda." *Policing* 3, no.2 (2009): 149-160.

<sup>22</sup> Travers, Max. "The idea of a Southern Criminology." *International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice* 43, no. 1 (2017): 1-12.

<sup>23</sup> Dimou, Eleni. "Decolonizing Southern Criminology: What Can the "Decolonial Option" Tell Us About Challenging the Modern/Colonial Foundations of Criminology?" *Critical Criminology* 29, (2021): 431-450.

<sup>24</sup> Liu, Jianhong. "The Asian Criminological Paradigm and How It Links Global North and South: Combining an Extended Conceptual Toolbox from the North with Innovative Asian Contexts." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 6, no. 1 (2017): 73-87.

<sup>25</sup> Cunneen, Chris, and Juan Marcellus Tauri. "Indigenous Peoples, Criminology, and Criminal Justice." *Annual Review of Criminology* 2, no. 1 (2019): 81-359.

bottom-up approach, that concentrates on historical criminological theories and the historical determinants that have influenced the nature of the offence.<sup>26</sup>

In summary, Southern criminology fundamentally disturbs the equilibrium in the construction of Northern criminological knowledge, including the production and distribution of knowledge. Therefore, Southern criminology as a growing challenge to Northern hegemony should not be underestimated or ignored.

### **3. The challenge posed by Southern criminology to Northern criminology's hegemony ought not be overstated**

Following the conclusion that the challenge posed by Southern criminology should not be underestimated, this section argues that it is overestimated.<sup>27</sup> Exploring through the lens of theoretical application, this section will illustrate how Northern criminological theory retains its explanatory relevance by encompassing Southern and Northern criminological perspectives. Considering the parallels between Northern and Southern criminology discussed so far, it can be argued that the challenges presented by the latter are overestimated.

#### **3.1 The universal explanatory power of the social control theory**

The challenges posed by Southern criminology require Northern criminological theory to encompass the crime phenomenon from the South, integrating it into the broader criminological knowledge base. However, it is suggested that Northern criminology might not be wholly inapplicable to the unique criminal phenomena in certain Southern societies.<sup>28</sup> Despite differences, there exist overlaps in criminal phenomena between the two hemispheres. One notable example is social control theory, which means that individuals do not commit offences resulting from the control of the external social environment, and that criminal conduct occurs when the individual's ties to society are

---

<sup>26</sup> Lawrence, Paul. "Historical criminology and the explanatory power of the past." *Criminology & Criminal Justice* 19, no. 4 (2018): 493–511.

<sup>27</sup> Matthews, Roger. "False Starts, Wrong Turns and Dead Ends: Reflections on Recent Developments in Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 25, no. 4 (2017): 577-591.

<sup>28</sup> Weis, Valeria V. "Towards a Critical Green Southern Criminology: An Analysis of Criminal Selectivity, Indigenous Peoples and Green Harms in Argentina." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 8, no. 3 (2019): 38–55.

broken.<sup>29</sup> The social control theory continues to offer substantial explanatory power for crime in Southern societies.<sup>30</sup> Northern criminological theory, which evolved as a tool of imperialistic control,<sup>31</sup> conciseness aims to facilitate the social control of the relationship between individuals and society. This implies that the state leverages criminological insights for strategic guidance on crime control and the use of punitive powers, evidencing the pertinence of criminology to governance.<sup>32</sup> For example, there is a strong emphasis on maintaining harmonious interpersonal relationships, especially those with close social ties in Southern societies.<sup>33</sup> Informal social control governed by unofficial groups or individuals based on moral rules<sup>34</sup> might be particularly effective in addressing unique cultural features such as collectivism, political dominance, and moral norms. Northern criminology can, therefore, be applied to Southern societies, maintaining its normative and practical relevance.

Moreover, social control theory offers explanations for crime phenomena that overlap between Southern and Northern societies, that is, crime phenomena in the field of globalisation. It is suggested that organised crime in the Global South poses one of the most significant threats to human security, democratic governance, and ecological development worldwide and the seriousness of crime reflects the particularity of the crime phenomenon in southern society.<sup>35</sup> However, this specificity is not sufficient to negate the universality of Northern criminological theories.<sup>36</sup> For instance, unemployment and poverty lead to crime due to broken social relations, a phenomenon

---

<sup>29</sup> Greenberg, David F. "The Weak Strength of Social Control Theory." *Crime & Delinquency* 45, no. 1 (1999): 66–81.

<sup>30</sup> Fonseca, David S. "Reimagining the sociology of punishment through the global-south: postcolonial social control and modernization discontents." *Punishment & Society* 20, no. 1 (2017): 54–72.

<sup>31</sup> Agozino, Biko. "Imperialism, crime and criminology: Towards the decolonisation of criminology." *Crime, Law and Social Change* 41, no. 4 (2004): 343-358.

<sup>32</sup> Garland, David, and Richard Sparks. "Criminology, Social Theory and the Challenge of our Times." *The British Journal of Criminology* 40, no.2(2000): 189-204.

<sup>33</sup> Warner, Barbara D, et al. "Racially Homophilous Social Ties and Informal Social Control." *Criminology* 53, no.2 (2015): 204-230.

<sup>34</sup> Lambert, Eric G, et al. "Correlates of Formal and Informal Social Control on Crime Prevention: An Exploratory Study among University Students, Andhra Pradesh, India." *Asian J Criminology* 7, no.3 (2012) :239-250.

<sup>35</sup> Weis, Valeria V. "Towards a Critical Green Southern Criminology: An Analysis of Criminal Selectivity, Indigenous Peoples and Green Harms in Argentina." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 8, no. 3 (2019): 38–55.

<sup>36</sup> Pereda, Valentin. "Why Global North criminology fails to explain organised crime in Mexico." *Theoretical Criminology* 26, no.4(2022): 620-640.



acute in Southern Europe, the industrial areas of Northern England, and the Rust Belt of the United States. This further supports the universality of Northern theories.<sup>37</sup>

### **3.2 The universal interpretive power of the decolonisation theory**

On the challenge to the dominant power of criminological knowledge in the North posed by the decolonisation movement of criminology in the South, the social phenomena of decolonisation in Southern societies can be interpreted through decolonisation theory within the Northern criminological knowledge framework. The topic of decolonisation in Southern criminology has advocated the dismantling of colonial structures and the redistribution of power, for example by focusing on the citizenship and sovereignty of marginalised groups in Southern societies.<sup>38</sup> Additionally, decolonialism's focus on the marginalisation of colonised identities can be explained by postcolonialism, which focused on the process of shaping the marginalised identities of colonised people since the 1980s.<sup>39</sup> For example, it focuses on the protection of the human rights of marginalised groups in immigrant societies, such as the United States, aligning with the topic of decolonization studies on the escape of indigenous marginalised identities.<sup>40</sup> In conclusion, although the decolonisation topics of Southern criminology challenge the colonialist-dominated Northern criminology,<sup>41</sup> the magnitude of this challenge should not be overestimated, because they do not fundamentally negate the universality of Northern criminology.

## **4. Acknowledging the importance of the methods of criminological theoretical research of the 21st century**

Although the above-analysed challenges posed by Southern criminology to Northern criminology's hegemony do not completely invalidate the universality of Northern

---

<sup>37</sup> Carrington, Kerry, et al. *Southern Criminology* (London and New York: Routledge 2018), Ch6.

<sup>38</sup> Ciochini, Pablo, and Joe Greener. "Mapping the Pains of Neo-Colonialism: A Critical Elaboration of Southern Criminology." *The British Journal of Criminology* 61, no.6 (2021):1612-1629.

<sup>39</sup> Fonseca, David S. "Reimagining the sociology of punishment through the global-south: postcolonial social control and modernization discontents." *Punishment & Society* 20, no.1 (2017): 54-72.

<sup>40</sup> Cunneen, Chris. "Postcolonial Perspectives for Criminology." In *What is Criminology?*, edited by Bosworth, Mary and Carolyn Hoyle. Oxford University Press, 2011, pp.249-266.

<sup>41</sup> Ball, Matthew. "Unsettling Queer Criminology: Notes Towards Decolonization." *Critical Criminology* 27, no.1 (2019): 145-161.

criminological theories, it is essential for Southern criminology to engage with them to foster the advancement of criminological knowledge in the 21st century. Primarily, and most noticeably, these challenges require traditional criminology to take criminological research thinking and methods seriously.<sup>42</sup>

#### 4.1 Resisting hegemonic thinking

Decolonised criminology in the contemporary era requires that Southern criminology confront and challenge hegemonic paradigms within the process of knowledge creation, striving to address the imbalance in the power dynamics of knowledge.<sup>43</sup> This endeavour includes seeking parity in dialogue for the progression of Southern criminology. The predominance of the English language in Northern criminology has contributed to a disparity in the spread of criminological knowledge,<sup>44</sup> and reinforced the hegemony of Northern criminological research.<sup>45</sup> The academic development of other non-English languages in southern societies, such as Spanish and Portuguese in South America, could help to undermine Northern hegemony.<sup>46</sup> Consequently, there is a heightened necessity to foster Southern criminology's opposition to Northern hegemonic perspectives. This includes resisting the constraints and biases that exist against Southern criminological research in scholarly forums and organisations and acknowledging and equating research in non-English languages with that from the North.<sup>47</sup> Additionally, opposing hegemony compels Southern criminology to persistently engage with decolonial matters.<sup>48</sup> For example, the Southern criminological agenda is increasingly centred on facilitating decolonisation via societal change. This involves

---

<sup>42</sup> Liu, Jianhong. "The Asian Criminological Paradigm and How It Links Global North and South: Combining an Extended Conceptual Toolbox from the North with Innovative Asian Contexts." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 6, no. 1 (2017): 73-87.

<sup>43</sup> Maldonado-Torres, Nelson. "ON THE COLONIALITY OF BEING." *Cultural Studies* 21, no.2-3 (2007): 240-270.

<sup>44</sup> Carrington, Kerry, and Russell Hogg. "Deconstructing Criminology's Origin Stories." *Asian J Criminology* 12, no.3 (2017): 181-197.

<sup>45</sup> Liu, Jianhong. "Asian Criminology – Challenges, Opportunities, and Directions." *ASIAN JOURNAL OF CRIMINOLOGY* 4, no.1 (2009): 1-9.

<sup>46</sup> Garland, David. "Concepts of culture in the sociology of punishment." *Theoretical Criminology* 10, no.4 (2006): 419-447.

<sup>47</sup> Dimou, Eleni. "Decolonizing Southern Criminology: What Can the "Decolonial Option" Tell Us About Challenging the Modern/Colonial Foundations of Criminology?" *Critical Criminology* 29 (2021): 431-450.

<sup>48</sup> Maldonado-Torres, Nelson. "ON THE COLONIALITY OF BEING." *Cultural Studies* 21, no.2-3 (2007): 240-270.

exploring how to disengage from the hegemonic colonisation of criminological knowledge rooted in the Northern Hemisphere through social change, such as decolonisation, and unearth indigenous criminological topics that originate locally.<sup>49</sup>

#### 4.2 Resisting oppositional dualism

In addition to averting a shift towards hegemonism, it is equally important to prevent falling into the extreme of creating a binary opposition between Southern and Northern criminological theories. It is necessary to eschew dualistic oppositional logic. There is a danger of hegemonic dualism, which means that Southern criminology and Northern criminology are antagonistically incompatible, and Southern criminology is unable to explain its way into the universality of Northern criminological knowledge, thereby subverting the universality of Northern criminology.<sup>50</sup> Notably, criminology cannot be divided only into Southern and Northern criminology - Eastern criminology, geographically and geopolitically situated between the South and the North, also plays a crucial role and cannot be disregarded.<sup>51</sup> Therefore, the dichotomy between Southern and Northern is neither existent nor definitive.<sup>52</sup>

From the perspective of Southern criminology's influence on the knowledge construction of Northern criminology, Southern criminology has impacted knowledge biases and imbalances.<sup>53</sup> The relationship between Southern and Northern criminology cannot be accurately captured by rigid, fixed geographical or economic binaries, as the reality is far more intricate and dynamic.<sup>54</sup> Therefore, the interaction between Southern and Northern criminology should be neither one of incompatibility nor antagonism, where

---

<sup>49</sup> Ciocchini, Pablo, and Joe Greener. "Mapping the Pains of Neo-Colonialism: A Critical Elaboration of Southern Criminology." *The British Journal of Criminology* 61, no.6 (2021):1612-1629.

<sup>50</sup> Donnermeyer, Joseph F. "The Place of Rural in a Southern Criminology." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 6, no.1(2017): 118-132.

<sup>51</sup> Piacentini, Laura, and Gavin Slade. "East is East? Beyond the Global North and Global South in Criminology." *The British Journal of Criminology* 64, no.3 (2023): 521-537.

<sup>52</sup> Moosavi, Leon. "A Friendly Critique of 'Asian Criminology' and 'Southern Criminology.'" *The British Journal of Criminology* 59, no.2 (2019): 257-275.

<sup>53</sup> Donnermeyer, Joseph F. "The Place of Rural in a Southern Criminology." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 6, no.1(2017): 118-132.

<sup>54</sup> Carrington, Kerry, and Russell Hogg. "Deconstructing Criminology's Origin Stories." *Asian J Criminology* 12, no.3 (2017): 181-197.

only one can prevail, but rather a relationship that can and should be dynamically adapted.

### 4.3 The role of empirical research

Regarding the influence on criminological research methodologies in the 21st century, it is acknowledged that criminology, as both a theoretical and empirical endeavour, ought to recognise and value the contributions of Southern criminology in terms of research samples, including the diversity and difference of Southern criminal phenomena as research samples.<sup>55</sup> Empirical research methods, while dominant in criminological research,<sup>56</sup> should be approached with caution. This is especially true in the context of Southern criminology, where inherent limitations, such as incomplete statistical samples due to researchers' value preferences, can be significant. The empirical findings on criminological issues specific to the South often raise questions about their broader applicability to other world regions.<sup>57</sup> There is a need for heightened awareness of regional variations in research samples and the potential impact of cultural differences on the veracity of data.<sup>58</sup> For instance, Aboriginal crime includes high rates of criminal activity, incarceration, and recidivism among Aboriginal Australians. The factors affecting Aboriginal crime are rooted in the local socio-economic and cultural environment and do not exist in other parts of the world.<sup>59</sup> Therefore, in conducting an empirical analysis of factors affecting Aboriginal crime, it is crucial to consider the impact of local Aboriginal people's special historical and cultural characteristics.<sup>60</sup> In summary, the results of the application of empirical research methods in Southern criminology do not apply to Northern criminology.

---

<sup>55</sup> Travers, Max. "The idea of a Southern Criminology." *International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice* 43, no. 1 (2017): 1-12.

<sup>56</sup> Tewksbury, Richard, et al. "The Prominence of Qualitative Research in Criminology and Criminal Justice Scholarship." *J Crim Just Educ* 21, no.4 (2010): 391-411.

<sup>57</sup> Travers, Max. "The idea of a Southern Criminology." *International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice* 43, no. 1 (2017): 1-2.

<sup>58</sup> Chin, Jason M, and Alex Holcombe. "Rethinking Replication in Empirical Legal Research." *UW Austl L Rev* 49, no.2 (2022): 76-112.

<sup>59</sup> Ralph, Folds. "Aboriginal crime at the cultural interface in Central Australia." *Crime, Media, Culture* 15, no.1 (2019): 107-124.

<sup>60</sup> Warren, Ian, and Emma Ryan. "Southern Criminologist, Indigenous Stories and Qualitative Research." *J Crim Just Educ* 33, no.2 (2022) :230-246.

## 5. Addressing the evolving theoretical content in 21st-century criminology

Beyond the impacts on research thinking and methodologies, it is also crucial for 21st-century criminology to address the imbalance in the construction of criminological knowledge as a way of progressing and developing further. This means incorporating Southern criminology into the theoretical system of 21st-century criminology, thereby enriching its theoretical content.

### 5.1 Collaborative development of restorative justice theory

Restorative justice theory has made some progress in northern criminological theory in the 21st century, such as the victim rights legislation in Scotland.<sup>61</sup> Restorative justice in Northern criminological theory is characterised as a process where those directly impacted determine the optimal means to rectify the harm caused by an offence, thereby helping communities to re-establish a sense of security that crime has compromised.<sup>62</sup> As an advanced judicial trend that strengthens human rights protection, restorative justice theory is poised to be integrated into the developmental trajectory of Southern criminological theories, increasing the contribution of Southern criminology to the broader knowledge construction of restorative justice theory.<sup>63</sup> Despite the divergent historical, cultural, and international backgrounds of Northern and Southern criminology, there exists both a necessity and a potential for the collaborative development of restorative justice. This collaborative effort could significantly contribute to bridging the knowledge gap between Northern and Southern criminology.<sup>64</sup> The shared values and cultural elements present in Northern and Southern societies render the joint development of restorative justice feasible. For instance, in New Zealand, Maori and other indigenous dispute resolution methods reflect a more restorative model of victim protection, including victim-offender mediation and family group conferencing, enriching

---

<sup>61</sup> Victims' Rights (Scotland) Regulations 2015.

<sup>62</sup> Daniels, Griff. "Restorative Justice: Changing the Paradigm." *Prob J* 60, no.3 (2013): 302-315.

<sup>63</sup> Ame, Robert K, and Seidu M Alidu. "Truth and Reconciliation Commissions, Restorative Justice, Peacemaking Criminology, and Development." *Crim Just Stud* 23, no.3 (2010): 253-268.

<sup>64</sup> Liu, Jianhong. "The Asian Criminological Paradigm and How It Links Global North and South: Combining an Extended Conceptual Toolbox from the North with Innovative Asian Contexts." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 6, no.1 (2017): 73–87.

the model of restorative justice in practice.<sup>65</sup> In contrast to previous time periods, when the only recourse available to victims was through the formal justice system,<sup>66</sup> these approaches align with both the Southern emphasis on maintaining harmonious social relationships and the Northern values of independence and individual rights.<sup>67</sup>

## 5.2 Rethinking social control theory in the context of immigration

The expanding realms of criminology in the 21st century encompass diverse fields such as immigration, postcolonialism, green criminology, and queer criminology.<sup>68</sup> Notably, Southern criminology confronts specific challenges related to immigration and environmental threats— issues that Northern societies cannot be overlooked by Northern societies due to their global impact.<sup>69</sup>

Contemporary, 21st-century social control theories in criminology need to address the challenges posed by global migration. This includes strategies to manage the risks and violence associated with migratory flows,<sup>70</sup> delineating safe boundaries between immigrants and non-immigrants, and formulating immigration policies that increase or decrease the rate of migration as appropriate.<sup>71</sup> Northern societies such as France, Germany, and Italy, which primarily receive immigrants,<sup>72</sup> act not only to address the

---

<sup>65</sup> Matthews, Roger. "False Starts, Wrong Turns and Dead Ends: Reflections on Recent Developments in Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 25, no.4 (2017): 577-591.

<sup>66</sup> Wendy, Drewery. "Restorative Practice in New Zealand Schools: Social development through relational justice" *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 48, no. 2, (2016): 191-203.

<sup>67</sup> Ashworth, Andrew. "Responsibilities, Rights and Restorative Justice." *Brit J Criminology* 42, no.3 (2002): 578-595.

<sup>68</sup> Carrington, Kerry, et al. "Criminology, Southern Theory and Cognitive Justice." In *The Palgrave Handbook of Criminology and the Global South*, edited by Carrington, Kerry, Russell Hogg, John Scott and Máximo Sozzo. Palgrave Macmillan, 2018, pp.3-17.

<sup>69</sup> Connell, Raewyn. "The Northern Theory of Globalization." *Sociological Theory* 24, no.4 (2007) :368-385.

<sup>70</sup> Campesi, Giuseppe, and Giulia Fabini. "Immigration Detention as Social Defence: Policing 'Dangerous Mobility' in Italy." *Theoretical Criminology* 24, no.1(2020) :50-70.

<sup>71</sup> Lyons, William T, and Lisa L. Miller. "Putting Politics in Its Place: Reflections on Political Criminology, Immigration and Crime." *Stud L Pol & Soc'y* 59, (2012) :123-154.

<sup>72</sup> Ignatans, Dainis, and Roger Matthews. "Immigration and the Crime Drop." *Eur J Crime Crim L & Crim Just* 25, no.3 (2017) :205-229.

correlation between immigration and crime rates by attempting to reduce crime rates associated with immigration but also strive to restore stable interracial relations that have been disrupted by immigration.<sup>73</sup> Conversely, Southern societies characterised by a higher emigration rate should address the related causes and consequences.<sup>74</sup> This includes factors like seeking asylum in Northern societies due to poverty or the ramifications of war, broadening the scope of research topics concerning immigration-related crimes.<sup>75</sup> To sum up, the theory of social control in the context of migration emphasises the restoration of social relations between migrants and non-migrants, which requires that Northern and Southern societies collaboratively re-evaluate how they approach these issues to prevent the erosion of societal coherence and stability in these regions.<sup>76</sup>

### **5.3 Rethinking green criminology in light of Southern development**

In the context of increasing globalisation, Southern and Northern societies should collaboratively address environmental challenges. The advent of green criminology theory in Southern societies, a significant development in the 21st century, offers essential insights for research in Southern criminology. This perspective is crucial, as the environmental conditions in Southern societies indirectly influence those in the North.<sup>77</sup> Traditional Northern green criminology should adapt to include issues of green crime, particularly considering the specific developmental level of Southern societies. For instance, the effects of Southern green cultural criminology's examination of environmental degradation have been explored from an indigenous perspective, suggesting that saving indigenous culture can serve as a way to achieve ecological justice and prevent green crime.<sup>78</sup> In conclusion, theoretical criminology should

---

<sup>73</sup> Smith, Justin. "Racial Threat and Crime Control: Integrating Theory on Race and Extending Its Application." *Critical Criminology* 29, no.2 (2021) :253-271.

<sup>74</sup> Cheong, Pauline H, et al. "Immigration, Social Cohesion and Social Capital: A Critical Review." *Critical Soc Pol'y* 27, no.1 (2007) :24-49.

<sup>75</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>76</sup> Chan, Janet. "Globalisation, Reflexivity and the Practice of Criminology." *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Criminology* 33, no.2 (2000): 118-135.

<sup>77</sup> Lynch, Michael J, et al. *Green Criminology: Crime, Justice, and the Environment* (University of California Press 2017), 21-47.

<sup>78</sup> Goyes, David R, et al. "Southern Green Cultural Criminology and Environmental Crime Prevention: Representations of Nature Within Four Colombian Indigenous Communities." *Crit Crim* 29, no.1 (2021): 469-485.

proactively respond to the challenges posed by Southern criminology. This is particularly evident in global criminal challenges, such as those related to immigration and environmental concerns, which necessitate a collaborative approach. This approach also fosters the evolution of both social control theory and green criminology theory, ensuring they are attuned to and provide guidance for the specifics of Southern society.

## **6. Conclusion**

In conclusion, this paper demonstrates that Southern criminology presents challenges to Northern criminology, influencing the previously imbalanced knowledge framework. However, these challenges are ultimately overstated because Southern criminology could be incorporated into Northern criminological understandings and universalities. The theories of social control and decolonisation in Northern criminology still have general explanatory power over Southern criminology. The influence of Southern criminology on 21st-century criminological theory warrants serious consideration for the enrichment of the overall field of criminology. Notably, criminological research thinking should confront hegemonism, abandon binary opposition, and seek to apply empirical research methods systemically. These challenges are particularly evident in globally relevant crime issues such as environmental crime and immigration, underscoring the need for Northern criminological theories to adequately address Southern crime concerns. Theoretical criminology should proactively respond to the challenges presented by Southern criminology, thereby fostering the concurrent development of Northern and Southern criminological perspectives.



## Bibliography

- Aas, Katja F. "The Earth is one but the world is not." *Theoretical Criminology* 16, no.1 (2012): 5.
- Agozino, Biko. "Imperialism, crime and criminology: Towards the decolonisation of criminology." *Crime, Law and Social Change* 41, no. 4 (2004): 343.
- Ame, Robert K, and Seidu M Alidu. "Truth and Reconciliation Commissions, Restorative Justice, Peacemaking Criminology, and Development." *Crim Just Stud* 23, no.3 (2010): 253.
- Ashworth, Andrew. "Responsibilities, Rights and Restorative Justice." *Brit J Criminology* 42, no.3 (2002): 578.
- Ball, Matthew. "Unsettling Queer Criminology: Notes Towards Decolonization." *Critical Criminology* 27, no.1 (2019): 145.
- Bowling, B. "Transnational Policing: The Globalization Thesis, a Typology and a Research Agenda." *Policing* 3, no.2 (2009): 149.
- Brown, Mark. "Truth and Method in Southern Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 29, no.3 (2021) : 451.
- Campesi, Giuseppe, and Giulia Fabini. "Immigration Detention as Social Defence: Policing 'Dangerous Mobility' in Italy." *Theoretical Criminology* 24, no.1(2020) :50.
- Carrington, Kerry, and Russell Hogg. "Deconstructing Criminology's Origin Stories." *Asian J Criminology* 12, no.3 (2017): 181.
- Carrington, Kerry, et al. *Southern Criminology* (London and New York: Routledge 2018).
- Carrington, Kerry, et al. "Criminology, Southern Theory and Cognitive Justice." In *The Palgrave Handbook of Criminology and the Global South*, edited by Carrington, Kerry, Russell Hogg, John Scott and Máximo Sozzo. Palgrave Macmillan, 2018.
- Carrington, Kerry, et al. "The resource boom's underbelly: Criminological impacts of mining development." *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Criminology* 44, no. 3 (2011): 335.
- Chan, Janet. "Globalisation, Reflexivity and the Practice of Criminology." *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Criminology* 33, no. 2 (2000): 118.

- Cheong, Pauline H, et al. "Immigration, Social Cohesion and Social Capital: A Critical Review." *Critical Soc Pol'y* 27, no.1 (2007) :24.
- Chin, Jason M, and Alex Holcombe. "Rethinking Replication in Empirical Legal Research." *UW Austl L Rev* 49, no.2 (2022): 76.
- Ciocchini, Pablo, and Joe Greener. "Mapping the Pains of Neo-Colonialism: A Critical Elaboration of Southern Criminology." *The British Journal of Criminology* 61, no.6 (2021):1612.
- Connell, Raewyn. "The Northern Theory of Globalization." *Sociological Theory* 24, no.4 (2007) :368.
- Cunneen, Chris, and Juan Marcellus Tauri. "Indigenous Peoples, Criminology, and Criminal Justice." *Annual Review of Criminology* 2, no. 1 (2019): 81.
- Cunneen, Chris. "Postcolonial Perspectives for Criminology" In *What is Criminology?*, edited by Bosworth, Mary and Carolyn Hoyle. Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Daniels, Griff. "Restorative Justice: Changing the Paradigm." *Prob J* 60, no.3 (2013): 302.
- Dimou, Eleni. "Decolonizing Southern Criminology: What Can the "Decolonial Option" Tell Us About Challenging the Modern/Colonial Foundations of Criminology?" *Critical Criminology* 29, (2021): 431.
- Donnermeyer, Joseph F. "The Place of Rural in a Southern Criminology." *International*
- Fonseca, David S. "Reimagining the sociology of punishment through the global-south: postcolonial social control and modernization discontents." *Punishment & Society* 20, no.1 (2017): 54.
- Garland, David, and Richard Sparks. "Criminology, Social Theory and the Challenge of our Times." *The British Journal of Criminology* 40, no.2(2000): 189.
- Garland, David. "Concepts of culture in the sociology of punishment." *Theoretical Criminology* 10, no.4 (2006): 419.
- Goyes, David R, et al. "Southern Green Cultural Criminology and Environmental Crime Prevention: Representations of Nature Within Four Colombian Indigenous Communities." *Crit Crim* 29, no.1 (2021): 469.
- Greenberg, David F. "The Weak Strength of Social Control Theory." *Crime & Delinquency* 45, no.1 (1999): 66.

- Ignatans, Dainis, and Roger Matthews. "Immigration and the Crime Drop." *Eur J Crime Crim L & Crim Just* 25, no.3 (2017) :205.
- Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 6, no.1(2017): 118.
- Lambert, Eric G, et al. "Correlates of Formal and Informal Social Control on Crime Prevention: An Exploratory Study among University Students, Andhra Pradesh, India." *Asian J Criminology* 7, no.3 (2012) :239.
- Laub, John H., and Robert J. Sampson. "The Sutherland-Glueck debate: On the sociology of criminological knowledge." *American Journal of Sociology* 96, no.6 (1991): 1402.
- Lawrence, Paul. "Historical criminology and the explanatory power of the past." *Criminology & Criminal Justice* 19, no. 4 (2018): 493.
- Liu, Jianhong. "Asian Criminology and Non-Western Criminology: Challenges, Strategies, and Directions." *International Annals of Criminology* 59, no. 2 (2021):103.
- Liu, Jianhong. "Asian Criminology – Challenges, Opportunities, and Directions." *ASIAN JOURNAL OF CRIMINOLOGY* 4, no.1 (2009): 1.
- Liu, Jianhong. "The Asian Criminological Paradigm and How It Links Global North and South: Combining an Extended Conceptual Toolbox from the North with Innovative Asian Contexts." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 6, no. 1 (2017): 73.
- Lynch, Michael J, et al. *Green Criminology: Crime, Justice, and the Environment* (University of California Press 2017).
- Lyons, William T, and Lisa L. Miller. "Putting Politics in Its Place: Reflections on Political Criminology, Immigration and Crime." *Stud L Pol & Soc'y* 59, (2012) :123.
- Maldonado-Torres, Nelson. "ON THE COLONIALITY OF BEING." *Cultural Studies* 21, no.2-3 (2007): 240.
- Matthews, Roger. "False Starts, Wrong Turns and Dead Ends: Reflections on Recent Developments in Criminology." *Critical Criminology* 25, no. 4 (2017): 577.
- Messner, Steven F. "When west meets east: Generalizing theory and expanding the conceptual toolkit of criminology." *Asian Journal of Criminology* 10, no.2 (2015): 117.

- Moosavi, Leon. "A Friendly Critique of 'Asian Criminology' and 'Southern Criminology.'" *The British Journal of Criminology* 59, no.2 (2019): 257.
- Moosavi, Leon. "Decolonising Criminology: Syed Hussein Alatas on Crimes of the Powerful." *Critical Criminology* 27, no.2 (2018): 229.
- Nelken, David. "Comparative Criminal Justice: Beyond Ethnocentrism and Relativism." *European Journal of Criminology* 6, no.4 (2009): 291.
- Pereda, Valentin. "Why Global North criminology fails to explain organized crime in Mexico." *Theoretical Criminology* 26, no.4(2022): 620.
- Piacentini, Laura, and Gavin Slade. "East is East? Beyond the Global North and Global South in Criminology." *The British Journal of Criminology* 64, no.3 (2023): 521.
- Ralph, Folds. "Aboriginal crime at the cultural interface in Central Australia." *Crime, Media, Culture* 15, no.1 (2019): 107.
- Scott, John G, et al. "What can Southern Criminology Contribute to a Post-Race Agenda?" *Asian Journal of Criminology* 13, no. 2 (2018): 155.
- Smith, Justin. "Racial Threat and Crime Control: Integrating Theory on Race and Extending Its Application." *Critical Criminology* 29, no.2 (2021) :253.
- Tewksbury, Richard, et al. "The Prominence of Qualitative Research in Criminology and Criminal Justice Scholarship." *J Crim Just Educ* 21, no.4 (2010): 391.
- Travers, Max. "The idea of a Southern Criminology." *International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice* 43, no. 1 (2017): 1.
- Victims' Rights (Scotland) Regulations 2015.
- Warner, Barbara D, et al. "Racially Homophilous Social Ties and Informal Social Control." *Criminology* 53, no.2 (2015): 204.
- Warren, Ian, and Emma Ryan. "Southern Criminologist, Indigenous Stories and Qualitative Research." *J Crim Just Educ* 33, no.2 (2022): 230.
- Weis, Valeria V. "Towards a Critical Green Southern Criminology: An Analysis of Criminal Selectivity, Indigenous Peoples and Green Harms in Argentina." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 8, no. 3 (2019): 38.

Wendy, Drewery. "Restorative Practice in New Zealand Schools: Social development through relational justice" *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 48, no. 2, (2016): 191-203